Exploration of factors that affect the desire of citizens to adopt e-government services: An empirically study on Bangladesh

Masud Rana¹, Gazi Md. Shakhawat Hossain², Maruf Hasan¹

¹PhD Scholar, Administrative Management, College of Public Administration, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, Wuhan, Hubei 430074, China, ²School of Management, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, Wuhan, Hubei 430074, China

Abstract

Purpose: This study aims to look at the factors that impact citizen's intentions to adopt e-government services in public sectors through the unified theory of acceptance and use of technology (UTAUT). Methodology: Recently, evolved organized poll is utilized exactly in this proposed research model. The sample size is 310 Bangladesh citizens. The questionnaire has been altogether inspected to comprehend the unwavering quality and the legitimacy while dissecting the information structural equation modeling method and AMOS apparatuses have been used. Findings: Performance expectancy, social influence, facilitating conditions, website quality, and internet experience (IE) fundamentally influenced conduct behavioral intent were the general outcomes that take up e-government services. Nevertheless, the standard of behavior does not rely on effort expectancy (p-estimate evaluated > 0.05). Implications: Policymakers and decision-makers used the result of this study for the advancement of a better intellectuality of citizens' needs. Furthermore, this study emolument was useful to enhance a lot of website designers should pay online users of e-government services more concentration to furthermore. Once more, the result of this study will deliver great worth recommendations through e-government to develop the regulation of ecumenical services. Originality/Value: To exploring the adoption of the e-government services, this paper is exhausting the UTAUT model. Like the anterior study, this research drives the signification of certain aspects that require to be deemed; meanwhile, the aim stands to e-government services reception in underdeveloped countries, more specifically in Bangladesh. Finally, adding a new construct by the authors contributed to the existing literature, which refers to website quality and IE.

Key words: Adoption, Bangladesh, e-government, underdeveloped countries, UTAUT model JEL Classification: H83, O33

INTRODUCTION

At present, e-government in many developed and developing countries around the world has become a popular focus for government efforts. Several of these countries have advanced to accomplish and adapt their e-government services and systems. The e-government services are designed to provide reliable services to citizens with more accessible, accurate, real-time, and high-quality information. In Bangladesh, the conduct of Information and

***Corresponding author:** Masud Rana, PhD Scholar, Administrative Management, College of Public Administration, Huazhong University of Science and Technology, 1037 Luoyu Road, Wuhan, Hubei 430074, China. Mobile: +8613164622675/+8801718342242. E-mail: mrana342@yahoo.com

Received: 11 August 2020; Accepted: 30 August 2020

DOI: 10.18843/ijcms/v11i3/04

DOI URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.18843/ijcms/v11i3/04

INDIAN JOURNAL OF COMMERCE & MANAGEMENT STUDIES • VOL XI • ISSUE 3 • SEPTEMBER 2020 • 30

Communication Technology (ICT) in government functions has to turn into a conventional phenomenon in current years (Akther et al., 2007). In 2004, the Bangladesh Enterprise Institute carried out the e-government report in Bangladesh. In 2002, the Government of Bangladesh has adopted a National IT Policy that reveals a strong commitment to attaining e-governance in Bangladesh. Bangladesh's IT Policy aims to create an IT nation that consists of a wisdombased society by 2010 (Sobhan et al., 2004). At the end of the 1990s, ICT started a new public administration online learning program (Sobhan et al., 2004). To date, various innovations have been used to enable the unusual features of e-government: Electronic data sharing, interactive voice replies, voice mail, correspondence, distribution of web services, virtual reality, and central public infrastructure (Hasan, 2003). The Hoque (2005) research highlights the e-government services of the Ministry of Establishment of the Republic of Bangladesh.

E-Government services are not only information on the web; they need a clear understanding of people's needs and needs (Kaliannan et al., 2007). The related research to introduce the e-government in Bangladesh is quite negligible. In the context of Bangladesh, a variety of styles of research has been done. Salam (2013) examined the public websites and e-government platform activity of respondents in Bangladesh. Another Alam (2012) study has analyzed existing e-government labyrinths and presented potential ideas for further progress. According to (Islam et al., 2012) propose e-government or Digital Bangladesh to strategic instrument management of the human resources, improving the IT infrastructures, reducing the obligation on resources, and trained IT staff at the popular level. Rokon-Ul-Hasan et al., (2013), however, focuses on government officials' policies and regulatory frameworks and does not replicate private organization's e-governance efforts. Research by (Tahir et al., 2013), highlights the involvement of government and private start-ups as well as NGOs in adopting e-government policies and regulatory structure. According to (Talukder et al., 2014) advises the development of e-government in Bangladesh, according to the role model countries such as Singapore, USA, EU, etc. However, several other researchers have highlighted growing challenges and barriers to e-government adoption in Bangladesh. In (Hossain, 2005), concluded that if the e-government cannot be spread worldwide, the accessibility to the e-government may be restricted to the minimum portion of urban residents.

Many previous studies have examined citizens' plan to use e-government services (Chatzoglou et al., 2015). Now developing countries, the pace of adoption of e-government is sluggish relative to that of emerging countries due to a variety of problems. Nevertheless, these experiments have failed to reach consensus, whereas most of their empirical findings are relatively straightforward. A wide range of variables influences government acceptance in developing countries such as Bangladesh. It is essential to understand and solve these problems for Bangladesh to implement and use e-government services successfully.

• What are the significant factors perceived by citizens' that influence the interactive intention to adopt e-government services in Bangladesh?

The key purpose of the present paper is to explore the issues influencing the desire of people to utilize online government facilities through the implementation of the unified theory of acceptance and use of technology (UTAUT) model. The UTAUT is an analytical model that conglomerates eight major adoption frameworks with extensions of technology. A set of variables that have never been systematically discussed before are included in the proposed conceptual framework. The importance lies in its in-depth results, observations, and methodological consequences. In the following section, the literature review is conducted shortly, and in Sections three and four, the proposed design method and the research hypothesis are explored. The analysis methods will be discussed in the fifth segment, and its main findings and assumptions will be concluded.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The analysis of electronic governance has been growing in recent years, allowing researchers to create specific theoretical and conceptual frameworks to understand better the various aspects of electronic governance (Lakka et al., 2013). The use of technology adoption models was clear from the very beginning in the study of e-government adoption. Therefore, apprehending multiple models and their related constructions in technology adoption are very important. Table 1 shows earlier studies defining proportions, associated latent variables, and calculating specific measurements based on different models that have systematically impacted decision-making on e-government services.

The analysis aims and the dependable and in dependable component were driven in this model. The study sorts to evaluate research involving electronic services, the evolution of electronic government, and how ICT infrastructure, level of education, demographic factors,

| Table 1: Proposed factors affecting the decision to adopt E-government service | | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|--|------------------------|----------------|---|---|
| Authors (Year) | Country | Model | Target Area | Sample size | Objectives | Key findings |
| (Alshehri et al., 2012) | Saudi Arabia | UTAUT Model | Public sectors | 400 | Looks for the prime factors of Saudi citizens' e-govt. adoption | Performance expectancy, effort expectancy, and facilitating conditions. |
| (Zafiropoulos et al., 2012) | Greece | The extended TAM, and DOI Theory | Teachers | 230 | Assessing the Acceptance of e-government Services. | Faith, comprehended risk, compatibility, relative advantage, job relevance, perceived usefulness, and perceived ease of use |
| (Chatzoglou et al., 2015b) | Greek | TAM2, and DOI Theory | Middle and Old age | 547 | Examining the factors that affect the desire of people to use e-government services. | Comprehended usefulness, comprehended faith, internet experience, peer influence, computer self-efficacy, and perceived risk. |
| (Mayasari et al., 2017) | Jakarta | Extended TAM Model | Govt. Officer | 414 | To analyze the implementation of the e-government of the users. | Perceived use, perceived ease of use, the perceived risk, and the subjective norm |
| (Bataineh and Al-Mutawa, 2016) | UAE | TAM Model | General Directorate | 466 | Identify the perceptions of potential end-users relating to factors which impact on e-services acceptance | Ease of use and perceived usefulness, trust |
| (Alomari et al., 2012) | Jordan | TAM, and DOI Theory | University Students | 400 | Explores the measurement of social factors in e-government adoption | Trust in terms of security and privacy and trust in government, attitudes and beliefs, internet and computer skill confidence, and website design. |
| (Alateyah et al., 2013) | Saudi Arabia | TAM, and DOI Theory | All Group Citizen | 20 | Factors Affecting the Citizen's Intention to Adopt E-government. | Quality, computer and information literacy, culture, lack of awareness, technical infrastructure, website design, and security. |
| (Gao, 2013) | USA | TAM, DOI, and UTAUT Model | College Students | 147 | To develops a two-stage model of factors influencing e-government acceptance. | Perceived usefulness, trust, and compatibility, perceived in formativeness, perceived ease of use and trust. |

(Contd...)

| Table 1: Continued | | | | | | |
|---|-----------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------|---|---|
| Authors (Year) | Country | Model | Target Area | Sample size | Objectives | Key findings |
| (Mensah et al., 2017) | China | UTAUT Model | African Students | 500 | To explore the predictors determining the willingness of African students in China to adopt and use e-government services. | Performance expectancy, effort expectancy, social influence, facilitating conditions and culture. |
| (Alzahrani and Goodwin, 2012) | Saudi Arabia | UTAUT Model | Government Officers | 169 | To assess E-government citizen acceptance | Consideration and inclusion of trust, privacy |
| (Baishya et al., 2017) | India | UTAUT Model | Middle Age | 166 | Explore the factors influencing the acceptance of e-district services by the citizens. | Perceived usefulness and facilitating conditions, effort expectancy, and social influence. |
| (Ahmad et al., 2014) | Pakistan | UTAUT Model | Older | 115 | To explore the factors that enable end-user adoption of e-government services. | Performance expectancy, effort expectancy, facilitating conditions, and social influence. |
| (Yarlikaş et al., 2012) | Turkey | TAM Model | Teachers | 30 | Identifies user satisfaction levels of e-government services. | Ease of use, system usefulness, system content, system usability, and ease of use. |
| (Arduini et al., 2013) | Italy | TAM Model | The Citizen of the Municipality | 389 | Factors that influence the adoption of e-services. | Perceived ease of use, and perceived usefulness. |
| (Suki et al., 2010) | Malaysia | TAM Model | Older | 200 | Identifies the factors that determine users' acceptance of e-government services. | Comprehended usefulness, ease of use, self-efficacy, facilitating conditions, and inward norms. |
| (Mobahi, 2012) | Iran | UTAUT Model | Government Employees | 100 | To the adoption of E-government services by government employees. | Effort expectancy, and performance expectancy, and social influence. |
| (Almuraqab and Information, 2017) | UAE | TAM, and DOI Theory | Citizens | 85 | Investigates the factors that affect the intention of natives to use m-govt. | Compatibility, perceived ease of use, social influence, and trust in technology. |

security, and privacy affected access to electronic government services through an electronic government program. The literature review also covers the thoughts

of several authors regarding e-governance, the appearance of electronic governance, and influencing factors of e-government in different countries.

INDIAN JOURNAL OF COMMERCE & MANAGEMENT STUDIES • VOL XI • ISSUE 3 • SEPTEMBER 2020 • 33-

RESEARCH MODEL AND HYPOTHESES DEVELOPMENT

The UTAUT model is one of the significant improvements in general technology acceptance models. This aims to interpret user intent for the use of the information system (IS) and to improve usage behavior, as did previous recognition and adoption models. According to (Venkatesh et al., 2003), produced a more comprehensive picture of the acceptance procedure in this synthesized model than any previous individual model had. In IS literature, eight constructs have been developed into an integrated model that is all focused on psychology, sociology, and communication. The model is TRA, TPB, TAM, TAM2, the Computer Use Motivational (MM) (Igbaria et al., 1996), the PC Using Model (MPCU) (Thompson et al., 1991), and the SCT (Bandura, 1977). Each model aims for a range of independent variables to predict and to analyze user behavior. The UTAUT maintains that four key buildings (expectation of performance, expected effort, social influence (SI), and conditions facilitating) are straight factors or predictors of the purpose of and conduct of use (Venkatesh et al., 2003). In comparison to those other hypotheses, UTAUT offers a better understanding of user awareness and the use of technologies (AlShafi and Weerakkody, 2009). This implies that a person's ability to use a particular instrument is affected by performance, ambition, and SI. Moreover, the theory suggests the intention of a consumer to use a given technology (compartmental purpose) and to promote circumstances usually influence the real use of technology (comportment) by the user. From the above discussion, we can make our conceptual framework, which is delineated in Figure 1. The proposed hypotheses are explained in the following section.

Performance Expectancy (PE)

PE can be clear as a way of understanding individuals to use a program and the degree of confidence in the fulfillment of the process (Venkatesh et al., 2003). There are five builders of various models which lead us to performance. These include perceived usefulness (Davis, 1989; Venkatesh and Davis, 2000; Taylor and Todd, 1995), inspiration from abroad (Davis et al., 1992; Rogers 2004), and expectations of consequences (Compeau and Higgins, 1995). They come from various models (Venkatesh et al., 2003; Al-Shafi, 2010). These are variants. Based on these studies, the current study posits the following hypothesis:

 H_1 : PE has a significant influence on the adoption attitude toward citizen's BI to use E-government services.

Effort Expectancy (EE)

In this study, the e-government programs' resource use has been defined as a convenience, and the EE variables are stated using the dimension of ease associated with using a given program (Al-Shafi and Weerakkody 2010; Venkatesh et al., 2003). It is simple to use (Davis, 1989; Venkatesh and Davis, 2000); it is nuanced (Thompson et al., 1991). We are all based on another trend (Venkatesh et al., 2003). The related research hypothesis to EE is:

 H_2 : EE has a significant impact on the adoption outlook to citizen's BI to use E-government services.



Figure 1: Research model. PE: Performance expectancy, EE: Effort expectancy, SI: Social influence, WQ: Website quality, FC: Facilitating conditions, IE: Internet experience, AA: Adoption attitude, BI: Behavioral intention, UB: Use behavior

Indian Journal of Commerce & Management Studies • Vol XI • Issue 3 • September 2020 • 34

SI

The vital role played by close people, friends, family, and colleagues in choosing to use a particular technology is demonstrated through SI (Venkatesh et al., 2003). Comportments of other people in the social and work cycle of a product have a significant impact on technological adoption on user activities. SI is described as a colonial power to visually defining determinants of BI as three builders (Ajzen, 1991; Davis, 1989; Taylor and Todd, 1995; Venkatesh and Davis, 2000) and imager. Such three designers have a meaningful impact when the consumers must use a mandatory program which is not automatic (Venkatesh et al., 2003). Previous research has shown that SI is among the significant inputs for the intention of consumption (Abu-Shanab, 2014; Dahi and Ezziane, 2015). Based on these prior studies, the current study revealed the following hypothesis:

H₃: SI has a significant impact on the adoption attitude toward citizen's BI to use E-government services.

Facilitating Conditions (FC)

FC is the level to which a person considers that an organizational and technical structure permits the use of a system (Venkatesh et al., 2003). This showed three core buildings: Systematic behavioral laws (Ajzen, 1991); simplifying conditions (Thompson et al., 1991); and coherence (Rogers, 2004). This definition was based on three key concepts: The FC is very essential to hire a product or service so that it is easy to use with the right environment, equipment, and resources. The system's actual use is directly predicted (Venkatesh et al., 2003). With various studies (Balaid et al., 2013), the direct influence of FC on BI is proposed. As per the above discussion, the following hypothesis was posited:

 H_4 : FC has a significant effect on citizen's BI to use E-government services.

 H_{4-1} : FC has a significant effect on UB of e-government services.

Website Quality (WQ)

WQ can be defined as the excellence of the website's structural design, which was relied on various ethics including technical excellence, content excellence, and appearance excellence (Aladwani, 2006). It is confirmed that the importance of WQ and the significant effects, it has on the adoption of e-government services. It is also mentioned that the government websites appear to be secure and safe, and

they are confident they can complete their connections with the government through those websites. The information and service quality of government websites are still less than the expectations level of citizens, which affect the actual use of e-government services. The website's quality construct is added in the UTAUT model as extended independent variables for their direct influence on the citizen's behavioral intention. The above answer makes it very easy to say that the quality of excellence has an impact on people's behavior and the use of e-government services. The following hypothesis was raised in line with the above discussion:

 H_5 : We must have a significant effect on the adoption attitude toward citizen's BI to use e-government services.

Internet Experience (IE)

The public's lack of internet knowledge, in particular in ICT is the primary factor affecting the adoption of electronic governance. The key reason for the absence of IT adoption, (Pons, 2004) found, is the heavy analphabetism. The most common use of information and services from e-government comes from people who have experienced the use of internet as a technology (Jaeger and Thompson, 2003; Thomas et al., 2003). Based on the empirical results, IE has a positive influence on the offer (Corbitt et al., 2003). The same conclusion was reached with (Cho, 2004), which states that experienced internet users can carry out online transactions more often if they feel the urge to do so. Alenezi and Karim (2010) agreed that higher IE corresponds to more robust BI results. Nevertheless, IE has a substantial impact on internet use (Lohse, Bellman and Johnson, 2000). It is worth considering that this is also the case with e-government services. Internet know-how is, therefore, a critical forecast for Bangladesh's e-government adoption. Thus, the hypothesis becomes:

 H_6 : IE has a significant effect on citizen's BI to use E-government services.

Behavioral Intention (BI)

The purpose of BI is to use new technology when it is essential for the person to check the use of a program by BI (Venkatesh and Bala, 2008). BI is closed. Venkatesh et al. (2003) claimed that it is necessary to know how the user's behavior must be objectively calculated. Because the e-government Walt study was absent, the review of the UTAUT model was used to examine the factors that influence the adoption (Al Awadhi and Morris, 2008). This suggests that BI has determined the use of e-government facilities. Ajzen (1991) notes that BI has a significant impact on the adoption of technology. Particularly in the assessment of the acceptability of technology, the relationship from BI to technology use and proper use is well established (Ajzen, 1991; Taylor et al., 1995; Venkatesh et al., 2003). The BI used in the current study, for example, to measure the actual use of e-government services using the e-government instrument, even if it is very interlinked with UB. The inference in this context can be predicted;

 H_{γ} : BI has a significant influence on the UB of e-government services.

The UTAUT is widely used to understand the creation of technological innovations in diverse contexts and environments in various research projects (Im et al., 2011; Kijsanayotin et al., 2009; White Baker et al., 2007). The UTAUT model gives a theoretical perspective to look into the conditions that influence the adoption and use of technological innovations in developing countries, for example, e-government. It may also serve as a useful guide for understanding the problems. The UTAUT was simplified for this paper [Figure 1] to illustrate from the standpoint of individuals the determinative factors for e-government adoption. Only the relations among the determinants are included in the modified model without the moderating variables in the original model. It helps us to explore the factors required to successfully implement and use e-government services in this simplified UTAUT model.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Research Instruments

This study examines the factors affecting the implementation of e-government services in Bangladesh. The author developed an empirical analysis using a survey tool to test the research model, evaluating the variables intended to determine the intention of an individual to use online public authorities. The questionnaire constructs are defined previously in Appendix 1.

Questionnaire Development

The 29 objects are built to fit 8 buildings modified from previous mafia inquiries (Ifinedo, 2008; Moore and Benbasat, 1991; Venkatesh and Bala, 2008; Venkatesh et al., 2003). This analysis extended the UTAUT model in addition to the WQ and IE systems to incorporate presumed buildings from other frameworks and theories such as. Objects from (Aladwani, 2006; Alenezi and Karim, 2010; Alomari et al., 2012; Sang and Lee, 2009), have been adapted for WQ and IE builds. The main attempt was made to analyze concerns relevant to e-government programs for the development of the questionnaires. Four specific items and two contingent objects (behavioral purpose and usage behavior) have been selected as the central framework of this study (UTAUT), which comprises four essential items (Venkatesh et al., 2003). The WQ and IE were both chosen as an extra component dependent on (Aladwani, 2006; Alenezi and Karim, 2010; Alomari et al., 2012). The questionnaire has been packed with related questions. The sources of different variables taken into account in the questionnaire are seen in Appendix 1. Likert 5-point scales range from "strong disapproval" to "strictly agreement" to shape the basis for answers to the questionnaire.

Sampling and Data Analysis Techniques

The Barishal citizens of Patuakhali District have been chosen for their unbiased survey using simple random methods. In this study, respondents included those people who are over 18 years old or who have used or at least know about the e-government service. Six hundred individuals were asked questions, 390 of which responded with 65% response rate. Nonetheless, only 310 data points have been considered correct, and these reliable data points are based on the tests. The research model was tested using the AMOS-23 computer software tool for structural equation modeling (SEM).

RESULTS

Demographic Profile of Respondents

The demographic profile of the respondents is shown in Table 2. Users over 18 years of age who have given up the e-government service were equipped with the questionnaire. The males were 85.48% and the women replied 14.52%. The bulk of those questioned was, therefore, male. The study showed that 37,74% were between 18 years of age and 30 years of age, 46,13% between 31 and 39 years of age, and 16,13% between 40 years and older. More than 65% of respondents are married, and around 80% have a child. The results also showed. University students were the majority of respondents. About 66.78% were university students, while 28.71% were public sector workers, and 71.29% were private sector employees. The majority of citizens, however, have modest Internet computer skills. Moreover, 77.42% of respondents spent over 3 h on the internet; 93.55% of those interviewed have home dial-up connections.

Rana, et al.

| Table 2: Demographic | characteristics of sampl | e | |
|---|--------------------------|-----------|------------|
| Variable | Description (coding) | Frequency | Percentage |
| Gender | Male | 265 | 85.48 |
| | Female | 45 | 14.52 |
| Age | 18–30 years | 117 | 37.74 |
| | 31–39 years | 143 | 46.13 |
| | More than 40 years | 50 | 16.13 |
| Marital status | Single | 97 | 31.29 |
| | Married | 213 | 68.71 |
| Have any children | Yes | 245 | 79.03 |
| | No | 65 | 20.97 |
| Educational qualification | Higher Secondary | 83 | 26.77 |
| | Bachelor | 110 | 35.48 |
| | Masters | 97 | 31.29 |
| | Others | 20 | 6.45 |
| Sector of occupation | Government | 89 | 28.71 |
| | Non-government | 221 | 71.29 |
| How do you describe your general computer knowledge | Poor | 95 | 30.65 |
| | Moderate | 150 | 48.39 |
| | Good | 65 | 20.96 |
| How would you describe your internet knowledge | Poor | 32 | 10.32 |
| | Moderate | 193 | 62.26 |
| | Good | 85 | 27.42 |
| How long have you been using the internet | <1 year | 26 | 8.39 |
| | 1–3 years | 158 | 50.96 |
| | More than 3 years | 126 | 40.65 |
| How often do you use the internet per day | 1–2 h | 01 | 0.320 |
| | 2–3 h | 69 | 22.26 |
| | More than 3 h | 240 | 77.42 |
| Network facilities at home | LAN | 290 | 93.55 |
| | Broadband | 20 | 6.45 |

Assessment of Convergent and Discriminant Validity

A validation system for a given model (Hair et al., 2013) has as its primary objective the confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). To test building validity using the CFA, an analysis of converging validity and distinguishing validity was used.

Convergent validity

In terms of variable, CR, and mean dependence difference (AVE), convergent validity was estimated. Convergent interest is estimated. The loading factor is about 0.52, CR is

about 0.60, and AVE is not a head convergent (2013) crosscross. You want AVE. Table 3 shows that the structural load in terms of recommended levels is calculated at between 0.754 and 0.976. The estimated CR values were between 0.725 and 0.743 and the measured AVE from 0.690 and 0.837 above 0.70 (Charter, 1999; Fornell and Larcker, 1981). Therefore, this analysis follows the convergent criterion of validity.

Discriminant validity

According to (Fornell and Larcker, 1981), the square AVE roots should be above variations to satisfy the distinctive

| Tal | ble 3: Convergent valid | ity results of the measure | ement model | |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------|-------------|-------|
| Constructs | Items | Estimates (loading | gs) CR | AVE |
| Performance expectancy | PE-1 | 0.860 | 0.942 | 0.766 |
| (PE) | PE-2 | 0.851 | | |
| | PE-3 | 0.900 | | |
| | PE-4 | 0.878 | | |
| | PE-5 | 0.886 | | |
| Effort expectancy (EE) | EE-1 | 0.872 | 0.862 | 0.764 |
| | EE-2 | 0.881 | | |
| | EE-3 | 0.976 | | |
| | EE-4 | 0.754 | | |
| Social influence (SI) | SI-1 | 0.889 | 0.890 | 0.837 |
| | SI-2 | 0.954 | | |
| | SI-3 | 0.844 | | |
| | SI-4 | 0.967 | | |
| Facilitating conditions (FC) |) FC-1 | 0.933 | 0.743 | 0.819 |
| | FC-2 | 0.943 | | |
| | FC-3 | 0.835 | | |
| Website quality (WQ) | WQ-1 | 0.833 | 0.918 | 0.690 |
| | WQ-2 | 0.857 | | |
| | WQ-3 | 0.838 | | |
| | WQ-4 | 0.811 | | |
| | WQ-5 | 0.814 | | |
| Internet experience (IE) | IE-1 | 0.908 | 0.863 | 0.765 |
| | IE-2 | 0.923 | | |
| | IE-3 | 0.789 | | |
| | IE-4 | 0.873 | | |
| Behavioral intention (BI) | BI-1 | 0.914 | 0.725 | 0.779 |
| | BI-2 | 0.904 | | |
| | BI-3 | 0.828 | | |
| use Behavior (UB) | UB-1 | 0.967 | 0.943 | 0.769 |
| | UB-2 | 0.766 | | |
| | UB-3 | 0.876 | | |
| | UB-4 | 0.911 | | |
| | UB-5 | 0.851 | | |

validity requirements. Furthermore, (Hair et al., 2013), reported that inequalities would be accepted if the AVEs were above the interscale square relations of the building. By measuring the absolute value, this study is used to determine the distinct validity of the connections between buildings and AVE's square roots. All of the AVE (diagonal cell's) square roots surpass the relationships between structures, as demonstrated in Table 4.

Results of hypothesis testing

To recognize ties between the structures in the research model, the structural model has been developed. The analysis tested the connection between dependent and independent variables with route (β) and t statistics. Table 5 shows the results for the structural model. The results show that the relationships between PE and BI (t = 5.232, $\beta = 0$.

| Table 4: Discriminant validity results of the measurement model | | | | | | | | |
|---|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| Constructs | PE | EE | SI | FC | WQ | IE | BI | UB |
| PE | 0.875 | | | | | | | |
| EE | 0.243 | 0.874 | | | | | | |
| SI | 0.410 | 0.306 | 0.915 | | | | | |
| FC | 0.265 | 0.421 | 0.276 | 0.905 | | | | |
| WQ | 0.356 | 0.252 | 0.183 | 0.120 | 0.831 | | | |
| IE | 0.265 | 0.494 | 0.306 | 0.212 | 0.331 | 0.875 | | |
| BI | 0.428 | 0.212 | 0.421 | 0.194 | 0.205 | 0.198 | 0.883 | |
| UB | 0.477 | 0.292 | 0.289 | 0.312 | 0.165 | 0.654 | 0.544 | 0.877 |

| Table 5: Structural model | | | | | | | |
|---------------------------|----------------------|---------|----------|---------|----------|--|--|
| Hypothesis | Relationship of path | β-value | CR-value | P-value | Comments | | |
| | IV Path DV | | | | | | |
| H ₁ | PE> BI | 0.371 | 5.232 | 0.00** | Accepted | | |
| H ₂ | EE> BI | 0.055 | -0.544 | 0.084 | Rejected | | |
| H ₃ | SI> BI | 0.165 | 3.690 | 0.00** | Accepted | | |
| H ₄ | FC> BI | 0.147 | 2.111 | 0.00** | Accepted | | |
| H ₄₋₁ | FC> UB | 1.963 | 3.877 | 0.00** | Accepted | | |
| H ₅ | WQ> BI | 0.476 | 4.821 | 0.00** | Accepted | | |
| H ₆ | IE> BI | 0.012 | 0.877 | 0.210 | Rejected | | |
| H ₇ | BI> UB | 0.365 | 5.874 | 0.00** | Accepted | | |

0.371, P < 0.05), SI and BI (t = 3.690, $\beta = 0.165$, P < 0.05), FC and BI (t = 2.111, $\beta = 0.147$, P < 0.05), WQ and BI (t = 4.821, $\beta = 0.476$, P < 0.05), and BI and UB (t = 5.874, $\beta = 0.365$, P < 0.05) were significant. Thus, H₁, H₃, H₄, H₅, and H₇ were supported. However, the relationships between EE and BI (t = -0.544, $\beta = 0.055$, 0.084 > 0.05), IE and BI (t = 0.012, $\beta = 0.877$, 0.210 > 0.05), were irrelevant and not subsidiary H₂ and H₆ in the present study.

DISCUSSION

This study aims to study and define the desire of people to use the UTAUT model to implement e-government services. This research validates the model and assesses the variance of the result variable. Due to the fact that UTAUT has been launched in this report, technology can be expanded. A new structure linked to the quality and internet interface of the website has been introduced to our present study. In view of our analysis, its concept is significant. As they think, the system's font size, screen position, naming, web link location, and alert feature are sufficient. Systems content plays a significant part in the e-government system, as the general use of this technology by people to access information. The study used a methodology for quantitative surveys. This is the first study in Bangladesh that examines the desire of citizens to implement governmental services through the use of the TAM model and the use of the SEM model. In reality, PE, SI, FC, WQ, and BI affected user behavior dramatically. EE and IE have not altered user behavior, however. The study's findings and model reinforce (Venkatesh and Davis, 2000) previously found that BI influences the intention of a person to use the technology (in this case, e-government systems) that, in chance, affects user behavior. This study shows that UTAUT was confirmed and shown to be valid and reliable. Because 81.92% of respondents have moderate or higher level computer literacy, the possible negative impact of IE on BI is uncertain. The latest results illustrate some earlier empirical results (Hope et al., 2003).

PE had an affirmative outcome on the intent to function. This outcome emphasizes that expectations of performance continue to be essential and a significant factor in actions (Venkatesh et al., 2003). EE had a detrimental effect on the intention to allow use of e-government services and on

the impact on the conformity with SI. In the case of the compatibility objective and the UB, the FC had a positive effect, which revealed that the FC is the significant predictor of behavioral intention and UB (Venkatesh et al., 2003). To impact the compartmental goal of using e-government services in Bangladesh, the quality website (WQ) has been found to be a significant moderator. IE has no significant impact on behavioral intention to adopt e-government. The government should be provided with proper infrastructure and planning for the use of e-government services.

IMPLICATIONS

Practical Implications

The findings of this study will allow researchers and practitioners, such as government policy-makers, to obtain useful information. This helps us to formulate and implement initiatives and strategies to enhance e-government services; educational activities will be focused on the value of the use of e-government facilities in people's everyday lives. To make greater use of online government services, the government will also apply operational excellence to its services and improve its consistency.

Theoretical Implications

The results of this study offer policy-makers an impact on increasing awareness of the advantages of e-government services. The difference between e-government theory and real practice could be bridged. The divisions are theoretical. The updated UTAUT model is a practical model in which to analyze the factors influencing the intention of people to use e-governmental services. It offers an insight into the problems that affect the efficient functioning of e-government, especially in Bangladesh.

CONCLUSIONS

The study provides empirical evidence of broad acceptance and benefit of e-government services, such as ease of use and timely services. The study looks at various factors linked to the approval of energy in Bangladesh. The UTAUT model was derived to determine the key factors that inspiration the adoption of e-government. We suggested that the conceptual model would provide internet usage and WQ. An updated UTAUT model that incorporates e-government factors was introduced to study the citizen's adoption of e-government services. The main metrics to analyze these groups, mostly borrowed from previously established objects, are also described in this document. The results show that people are more prepared to take e-government services when the quality and efficacy of these services increase. Using UTAUT, they have implemented four processes (i.e., performance goals, commitment standards, social impact, and usability). Besides, the government should provide adequate information and organized infrastructure and growth for e-services. The geographical coverage of this study is limited, and prospective scholars should also increase the sample size to ensure that interviewees are demographically diverse. We have developed our model through an existing literature review than having collected data from Bangladesh. We have tested the validity and reliability of this model. Test results indicate that this model is valid and capable of making a valuable contribution to explaining the adoption of e-government service in developing country contexts.

Recommendations

This study examined the factors that affect the adoption from the citizen's point of view of e-government services. This study can, therefore, serve as a starting point for work on e-government adoption, which is essential and necessary to encourage its acceptance and use. Based on the results of this study, some suggestions for both developers and policy-makers can be created.

- To raise awareness among its citizens, the Government of Bangladesh will adopt a cohesive strategy that is based on four factors (PE, EE, SI, and FC). To engage citizens more, the government should conduct a promotional campaign about E-government applications.
- ii. The government will include key ordinary persons in an awareness drive on the use of e-government services to boost potential users' confidence and trust.
- iii. The government will concentrate on providing the citizen with basic training and resources to implement e-government services successfully.

LIMITATIONS AND FURTHER RESEARCH DIRECTION

More than 6 variables should be concentrated on future studies, as the factors which influence the intention for citizens of government services to adopt e-government cannot fully explain some variables. Consequently, initial results cannot be forecast. Future researchers also must increase the sample size and different roles to overcome these limitations.

REFERENCES

- Abu-Shanab, E. (2014). Antecedents of trust in e-government services: An empirical test in Jordan. *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy*, 8, 480-499.
- Ahmad, M.O., Markkula, J., Oivo, M. (2014). Factors affecting e-government adoption in Pakistan: A citizen's perspective. *Transforming Government People Process and Policy*, 7(2), 1108.
- Ajzen. (1991). The theory of planned behavior. Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 50(2), 179-211.
- Akther, S., Onishi, T., Kidokoro, T. (2007). E-government in a developing country: Citizen-centric approach for success, *International Journal of Electronic Governance*, 1, 14342.
- Aladwani, A. (2006). An Empirical test of the link between web site quality and forward enterprise integration with web consumers, *Business Process Management Journal*, 12, 178-190.
- Alam, Mohammad. (2012). E-Governance in Bangladesh: Present Problems and Possible Suggestions for Future Development, *International Journal of Applied Information Systems* 4(8). 21-25.
- Alateyah, S.A., Richard, C., Gary, W. (2013). Factors affecting the citizen's intention to adopt E-government in Saudi Arabia. World Academy of Science, Engineering and Technology, 81, 601-606.
- Al Awadhi, S., Morris, A. (2008). *The Use of the UTAUT Model in the Adoption of E-government Services in Kuwait.* Paper Presented at the Proceedings of the 41st annual Hawaii international conference on System Sciences.
- Alenezi, A.R., Karim, A., Malek, A., Veloo, A. (2010). An empirical investigation into the role of enjoyment, computer anxiety, computer self-efficacy and internet experience in influencing the students' Intention to use E-learning: A case study from Saudi Arabian governmental universities, *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 9(4), 22-34.
- Almuraqab, N. (2017). M-Government adoption factors in the UAE: A partial least squares approach, *International Journal of Business and Information*, 11, 404-431..r
- Alomari, M., Peter, W., Kuldeep, S. (2012). Predictors for e-government adoption in Jordan: Deployment of an empirical evaluation based on a citizen-centric approach. *Information Technology and People*, 25, 207-234.
- Al-Shafi, S., Weerakkody, V. (2009). Understanding Citizens' Behavioural Intention in the Adoption of E-government Services in the State of Qatar,

ECIS Proceedings. p430. Available from: *https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?* doi=10.1.1.232.3935&rep=rep1&type=pdf.

- Al-Shafi, S., Weerakkody, V. (2010). Factors Affecting E-government Adoption in the State of Qatar. European and Mediterranean Conference on Information Systems.
- Alshehri, M., Drew, S., Alhussain, T., Alghamdi, R.J. (2012). The Effects of Website Quality on Adoption of E-Government Service: An Empirical Study Applying UTAUT Model Using SEM. Melbourn, Australia: Conference 23rd Australasian Conference On Information SystemsAt.
- Alzahrani, M., Goodwin, R. (2012). Towards a UTAUTbased model for the study of E-government citizen acceptance in Saudi Arabia, *International Journal of Economics and Management Sciences*, 6(4), 109-115.
- Arduini, D., Denni, M., Lucchese, M., Nurra, A., Zanfei, A. (2013). The role of technology, organization and contextual factors in the development of e-government services: An empirical analysis on Italian local public administrations. *Structural Change and Economic Dynamics*, 27, 177-189.
- Baishya, K., Samalia, H.V., Joshi, R. (2017). Factors influencing E-district adoption: An empirical assessment in indian context, *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 7(1), 514-520.
- Baker, E.W., Al-Gahtani, S.S., Hubona, G.S. (2007). The effects of gender and age on new technology implementation in a developing country: Testing the theory of planned behavior (TPB). *Information Technology and People*, 20(4), 352-375.
- Balaid, A., Ali, A., Noorminshah, I. (2013). Factors influencing students' intention to use mlearning, *Journal of Information Systems Research and Innovation*, 5, pp.01-08
- Bandura, A. (1977). Self-efficacy: Toward a unifying theory of behavioral change. Advances in Behaviour Research and Therapy, 1(4), 139-161.
- Bataineh, E., Al-Mutawa, S. (2016). An analysis study of factors that determine e-services usage by end users: A case study, *Journal of e-Government Studies and Best Practices*, 1, 371910.
- Charter, R.A. (1999). Sample size requirements for precise estimates of reliability, generalizability, and validity coefficients, *Journal of Clinical and Experimental Neuropsychology*, 21(4), 559-566.
- Chatzoglou, P., Chatzoudes, D., Symeonidis, S. (2015). Factors Affecting the Intention to use e-Government Services. Federated Conference on Computer Science and Information Systems (FedCSIS), Lodz, 2015, pp. 1489-1498, doi: 10.15439/2015F171..

- Cho, E. (2004). Likelihood to abort an online transaction: Influences from cognitive evaluations, attitudes, and behavioral variables. *Information and Management*, 41, 827-838.
- Compeau, D., Higgins, C. (1995). Computer self-efficacy: Development of a measure and initial test. *MIS Quarterly*, 19, 189-211.
- Corbitt, B., Thanasankit, T., Yi, H. (2003). Trust and E-commerce: A study of consumer perceptions. *Electronic Commerce Research and Applications*, 2, 203-215.
- Dahi, M., Ezziane, Z.J. (2015). Measuring e-government adoption in Abu Dhabi with technology acceptance model (TAM), *International Journal of Electronic Governance*, 7(3), 206.
- Davis, F., Richard, B., Paul, W. (1989). User acceptance of computer technology: A comparison of two theoretical models. *Management Science*, 35, 982-1003.
- Davis, F.D., Bagozzi, R.P., Warshaw, P.R. (1992). Extrinsic and intrinsic motivation to use computers in the workplace, *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 22(14), 1111-1132.
- Fornell, C., Larcker, D.F. (1981). Structural Equation Models with Unobservable Variables and Measurement Error: Algebra and Statistics. Los Angeles, CA: SAGE Publications Sage CA.
- Gao, Y. (2013). The influences of cognitive factors and trust on e-government acceptance: Evidence from a two-stage model. *Review of Business Information Systems*, 17(4), 153-158.
- Hair, J., Ringle, C., Sarstedt, M. (2013). Partial least squares structural equation modeling: Rigorous applications, better results and higher acceptance. *Long Range Planning*, 46, 1-12.
- Hasan, S. (2003). Introducing E-government in Bangladesh: Problems and prospects. *International Social Science Review*, 78, 111-125.
- Hope, D., Gries, C., Zhu, W., Fagan, W., Redman, C., Grimm, N., Nelson, A., Martin, C., Kinzig, A. (2003). *Socioeconomics drive urban plant diversity*. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 100, 8788-8792.
- Hoque, S.M.S. (2005). E-governance in Bangladesh: Initiatives and Challenges. Bangladesh: Rajshahi University.
- Hossain, F. (2005). E-Governance initiatives in developing countries: Helping the rich? Or, creating opportunities for the poor? *Asian Affairs*, 27(4), 5-23.
- Ifinedo, P. (2008). Factors Affecting the Acceptance of Internet and E-Business Technologies in Atlantic Canada's SMEs: A Structural Equation Model. Conference: Learning from the Past and Charting the

Future of the Discipline. p404.

- Igbaria, M., Parasuraman, S., Baroudi, J. (1996). A motivational model of microcomputer usage, *Journal* of Management Information Systems, 13(1), 127-143. Available from: http://www.jstor.org/stable/40398206. [Last accessed on 2020 Sep 22].
- Im, IL., Hong, S., Kang, M. (2011). An international comparison of technology adoption Testing the UTAUT model. *Information and Management*, 48, 1-8.
- Islam, Z.R. (2012). Preparation of E-Government in Bangladesh: An exploratory analysis, JU Journal of Information Technology, 1, 7046.
- Jaeger, P., Kim, T. (2003). E-government around the world: Lessons, challenges, and future directions. *Government Information Quarterly*, 20, 389-394.
- Kaliannan, M., Awang, H., Raman, M. (2007). Technology Adoption in the Public Sector: An Exploratory Study of e-Government in Malaysia. Paper Presented at the Proceedings of the 1st International Conference on Theory and Practice of Electronic Governance.
- Kijsanayotin, B., Pannarunothai, S., Speedie, S. (2009). Factors influencing health information technology adoption in Thailand's community health centers: Applying the UTAUT model, *International Journal of Medical Informatics*, 78, 404-416.
- Lakka, S., Stamati, T., Michalakelis, C., Martakos, D. (2013). What drives eGovernment growth? An econometric analysis on the impacting factors, *International Journal* of *Electronic Governance*, 6, 20-6.
- Lohse, G., Bellman, S., Johnson, E.J. (2000). Consumer buying behavior on the Internet: Findings from panel data, *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 14(1), 15-29.
- Mayasari, I., Hendrowati, R., Sofia, A., Wiadi, I. (2017). Implementation of E-Government through Implementation of technology acceptance model, *Jurnal Aplikasi Manajemen*, 15, 659-669.
- Mensah, I., Mi, J., Feng, C. (2017). Determinants of E-government services adoption from the african students' perspective, *International Journal of Educational and Pedagogical Sciences*, 11(10), 2467-2470.
- Mobahi, H. (2012). The Adoption of E-government Services by Employees in Iran: Case study: Rasht Municipality (Dissertation). Avaialble from: http://www.urn.kb.se/ resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:ltu:diva-45111.
- Moore, G.C., Benbasat, I. (1991). Development of an instrument to measure the perceptions of adopting an information technology innovation. *Information System Research*, 2(3), 192.
- Pons, A. (2004). E-government for arab countries. Journal of Global Information Technology Management, 7, 30-46.
- Rogers, (2004). A prospective and retrospective look at the

diffusion model. 9(S1), 13-19.

- Rokon-Ul-Hasan, M., Monem, M. (2013). E-governance preparedness of public bureaucracy in Bangladesh. In: Digital Public Administration and E-Government in Developing Nations: Policy and Practice. Pennsylvania, United States: IGI Global.
- Salam, M.A. (2013). E-governance for Good Governance through Public Service Delivery: An Assessment of District e-Service Centres in Bangladesh. Bangladesh: BRAC University.
- Sang, S., Lee, J. (2009). A Conceptual Model of e-Government Acceptance in Public Sector. *Cancun:* 3rd International Conference on Digital Society. p71-76.
- Sobhan, F., Shafiullah, M., Hossain, Z., Chowdhury, M.J. (2004). Study of E-Government in Bangladesh. Research Report, Bangladesh Enterprise Institute, Bangladesh.
- Suki, M.N., Ramayah, T. (2010). User acceptance of the E-government services in Malaysia: Structural equation modelling approach, *Interdisciplinary Journal* of Information, Knowledge, and Management, 5, 1308.
- Tahir, M., Cao, C., Butt, F., Idrees, F., Aslam, I., Ali, Z., Tanvir, M., Rizwan, M., Mahmood, T. (2013). Tubular graphitic-C3N4: A Prospective material for energy storage and green photocatalyst, *Journal of Materials Chemistry A*, 1, 13949-13955.
- Talukder, S.K., Sakib, M.I.I., Rahman, M.M. (2014). Model for E-Government in Bangladesh: A Unique ID Based

Approach. Paper Presented at the 2014 International Conference on Informatics, Electronics and Vision.

- Taylor, S., & Todd, P. A. J. I. s. r. (1995). Understanding information technology usage: A test of competing models. 6(2), 144-176.
- Thomas, J. (2003). The new face of government: Citizeninitiated contacts in the era of e-government, *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 13, 83-102.
- Thompson, R.L., Higgins, C.A., Howell, J.M. (1991). Personal computing: Toward a conceptual model of utilization. *MIS Quarterly*, 15, 124-143.
- Venkatesh, V., Bala, H. (2008). Technology acceptance model 3 and a research agenda on interventions. *Decision Sciences*, 39(2), 273-315.
- Venkatesh, V., Davis, F. (2000). A theoretical extension of the technology acceptance model: Four longitudinal field studies. *Management Science*, 46(2), 186-204.
- Venkatesh, V., Morris M., Davis, F.D. (2003). User acceptance of information technology: Toward a unified view. *MIS Quarterly*, 27, 425-478.
- Yarlikaş, S., Arpaci, I., Gulgun, A.A. (2012). User acceptance of eGovernment services: Analysis of users' satisfaction level based on technology acceptance model. In: *Industrial Dynamics, Innovation Policy, and Economic Growth through Technological Advancements.* Pennsylvania, United States: IGI Global. p348-362.
- Zafiropoulos, K., Karavasilis, I., Vrana, V. (2012). Assessing the adoption of E-government services by

APPENDIX

| Appendix 1: Research instruments | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------------|---|-----------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | Performance expectancy | | | | | | | |
| | Items | Source | | | | | | |
| PE-1 | I will meet my desires from the public sector more quickly and competently with the use of the e-government services. | (Venkatesh et al., 2003) | | | | | | |
| PE-2 | The use of e-government services improves equality among all citizens. | | | | | | | |
| PE-3 | It saves time for citizen to use e-government services. | | | | | | | |
| PE-4 | The quality of services recovers with the use of e-government services. | | | | | | | |
| PE-5 | For my job, I consider this e-service helpful. | | | | | | | |
| | Effort expectancy | | | | | | | |
| EE-1 | I have a clear and understandable experience with this e-service. | (Venkatesh | | | | | | |
| EE-2 | In using this e-service, it is simple for me to become competent. | et al., 2003) | | | | | | |
| EE-3 | It is simple for me to know how to use this e-service feature. | | | | | | | |
| EE-4 | It is quick to use the e-government services program. | | | | | | | |
| | Social influence | | | | | | | |
| SI-1 | People who effect my actions claim I should use the resources of e-government. | (Venkatesh | | | | | | |
| SI-2 | When my friends and colleagues used them, I'd prefer e-government services. | et al., 2003) | | | | | | |
| SI-3 | Sectors of government encourage citizens to use the public services program. | | | | | | | |
| SI-4 | The citizen maintained the use of the e-service. | | | | | | | |
| | Facilitating conditions | | | | | | | |
| FC-1 | I have the ability to use this e-service | (Venkatesh | | | | | | |
| FC-2 | The entire process of my work cannot be consistent with this e-service. | et al., 2003) | | | | | | |
| FC-3 | For using this e-service, I have the necessary knowledge. | | | | | | | |
| | Website quality | | | | | | | |
| WQ-1 | Government websites safe and safe for transections. | (Aladwani, | | | | | | |
| WQ-2 | The website of the government looks attractive and uses proper fonts and colors. | 2006; <u>Alomari</u> | | | | | | |
| WQ-3 | The websites of government look coordinated. | Sang and Lee, | | | | | | |
| WQ-4 | Government websites are always open on and around the world. | 2009) | | | | | | |
| WQ-5 | The government website contents are helpful and revised. | | | | | | | |
| | Behavioral intention to use | | | | | | | |
| BI-1 | In future, I plan to use e-government service. | (Venkatesh | | | | | | |
| BI-2 | During my ordinary life, I'll still strive to use e-government. | et al., 2003) | | | | | | |
| BI-3 | I expect to actively use e-government | | | | | | | |
| User behavior | | | | | | | | |
| UB-1 | The e-service suits the job's objectives. | (Venkatesh | | | | | | |
| UB-2 | It helped me to take control of my work using this e-service. | et al., 2003) | | | | | | |
| UB-3 | To order to carry out my official proposal, I want to use e-government services. | | | | | | | |
| UB-4 | l use e-government services regularly. | | | | | | | |

